

News, cases, companies, firms

Search (#) Advanced Search (/advanced\_search)

E-MAIL NEWSLETTERS (/newsletters)

News Sections (#AllSections) Alerting Tools (#Tools) Jobs (http://jobs.law360.com/) Morris, Nichols, ... | Sign In (/account/login?)

# Apple iPhones Flout Patents Tied To Sony, Nokia, Jury Says

By Ryan Davis

Share us on:

Law360, New York (December 13, 2012, 3:16 PM ET) -- A Delaware federal jury ruled Thursday that Apple Inc (/companies/apple-inc)'s iPhone infringes three patents covering call handling and camera technology that are held by a company formed by subsidiaries of Sony Corp (/companies/sony-corporation). of America, Nokia Corp (/companies/nokia-corporation). and patent-holding company MPEG LA (/companies/mpeg-la)LLC.

Following a nine-day trial in the District of Delaware, the jury ruled that Apple directly infringed three patents owned by MobileMedia Ideas LLC and rejected Apple's claim that they were invalid as obvious or anticipated. Damages will be determined in a separate phase of the case.

The jury found that Apple's iPhone 3G, 3GS and 4 infringed the patents. Two of the three patents-in-suit cover call-handling technology, including rejecting incoming calls, while the the third covers a personal communications device including a camera.

"We're pleased the court found infringement on all three patents and we think it's justified," a MobileMedia spokesman said Thursday.

An representative of Apple could not immediately be reached for comment on the verdict Thursday.

MobileMedia also has patent suits pending against Research In Motion Ltd (/companies/research-in-motion-limited). in the Northern District of Texas and HTC Corp. in the Eastern District of Texas. Those suits and the suit against Apple were all filed in April 2010.

Earlier this year, Apple moved to dismiss the suit, arguing that MobileMedia lacked sufficient rights to sue for infringement or that it could not sue without bringing in Sony and Nokia as parties.


In August, U.S. District Judge Sue L. Robinson denied the motion to dismiss, ruling that while the parent companies have retained some rights of the patents-in-suit, their rights were not "substantial" as opposed to the rights held by MobileMedia.

MobileMedia was created pursuant to a formation and framework agreement set up by three subsidiaries of

 (/articles/401398/print?)

 section=ip) (/articles/401398/share?)

 section=ip) (/about/rights\_and\_reprints?)

 article\_id=401398) (/about/editorial\_contacts)

Documents

Verdict

Case Information

### Case Title

MobileMedia Ideas LLC v. Apple Inc. (/cases/4d4aca982f02213137000001)

### Court

Delaware (/courts/delaware)

### Nature of Suit

Patent (/search/cases?q=nos:%22Patent%22)

### Case Number

1:10-cv-00258 (/cases/4d4aca982f02213137000001)

### Judge

Sue L. Robinson (/judges/sue-l-robinson)

### Date Filed

March 30, 2010

### Related

#### Sections

[Intellectual Property \(/ip\)](#)

[Technology \(/technology\)](#)

#### Law Firms

[Fish & Richardson \(/firms/fish-richardson\)](#)

[Morris James \(/firms/morris-james\)](#)

[Morris Nichols \(/firms/morris-nichols\)](#)

[O'Melveny & Myers \(/firms/o-melveny-myers\)](#)

[Proskauer Rose \(/firms/proskauer-rose\)](#)

[Young Conaway \(/firms/young-conaway\)](#)

#### Companies

[Apple Inc. \(/companies/apple-inc\)](#)

[MPEG LA \(/companies/mpeg-la\)](#)

[Nokia Corporation \(/companies/nokia-corporation\)](#)

[Research In Motion Limited \(/companies/research-in-motion-limited\)](#)

[Sony Corporation \(/companies/sony-corporation\)](#)

#### Articles

[Apple Still On Hook In MobileMedia Smartphone IP Suit](#)

### Got an idea for a story?

Email editor@law360.com (mailto:editor@law360.com).

### Got the inside scoop but prefer to stay out of the spotlight?

Email offtherecord@law360.com (mailto:offtherecord@law360.com).

## Intellectual Property

### Adam Sandler Shakes 'Just Go With It' Copyright Suit (/ip/articles/401593/adam-sandler-shakes-just-go-with-it-copyright-suit?article\_more\_news=1)

A California federal judge on Thursday tossed a suit accusing Adam Sandler and others of stealing the script for the 2011 romantic comedy "Just Go With It," finding the writer of a 12-page story that also features scatological humor could not show a substantial similarity between the two works.

### Thrift Store Says Wood Herron Mised Copyright Office (/ip/articles/401286/thrift-store-says-wood-herron-mised-copyright-office?article\_more\_news=1)

Cincinnati-based IP firm Wood Herron & Evans LLP was hit with a lawsuit Wednesday alleging one of its partners misled the U.S. Copyright Office by submitting intentionally false electronic source code on behalf of a client embroiled in a licensing dispute.

### Ousted ISC Exec Can't Use Broker's Client Data, Court Rules (/ip/articles/401431/ousted-isc-exec-can-t-use-broker-s-client-data-court-rules?article\_more\_news=1)

A Texas appellate court on Wednesday said investment firm ISC Group Inc. is entitled to a broader injunction in a trade secrets case against its former vice president that would stop him from using confidential client data to solicit the clients to his new business.

## Technology

### Thrift Store Says Wood Herron Mised Copyright Office (/technology/articles/401286/thrift-store-says-wood-herron-mised-copyright-office?article\_more\_news=1)

Cincinnati-based IP firm Wood Herron & Evans LLP was hit with a lawsuit Wednesday alleging one of its partners misled the U.S. Copyright Office by submitting intentionally false electronic source code on behalf of a client embroiled in a licensing dispute.

### NY Hospitals Overpriced Contract Bid By \$500M, Allscripts Says (/technology/articles/401464/ny-hospitals-overpriced-contract-bid-by-500m-allscripts-says?article\_more\_news=1)

Allscripts Healthcare Solutions Inc. sued New York City's public hospital system Thursday, seeking to block the award of a lucrative contract for electronic medical records to a rival company and accusing public officials of overstating the price of its bid by more than \$500 million.

Sony, Nokia and MPEG: Tagivan LLC, Nokia Capital Inc. and SCA IPLA Holdings Inc. MPEG holds a 50.2 percent share, while Nokia Capital and SCA each hold 24.9 percent shares.

According to its website, MobileMedia owns more than 300 patents worldwide that are important to mobile devices and cover innovations like call handling, speed dial, and still and video processing.

The patents-in-suit are U.S. Patent Numbers 6,070,068, issued in 2000 and titled "Communication terminal device and method for controlling a connecting state of a call into a desired connection state upon a predetermined operation by a user"; 6,253,075, issued in 2001 and titled "Method and apparatus for incoming call rejection"; and 6,427,078, issued in 2002 and titled "Device for personal communications, data collection and data processing, and a circuit card."

Apple is represented by Tara D. Elliott, Ruffin B. Cordell and Frank E. Scherkenbach of Fish & Richardson PC ([/firms/fish-richardson](#)), Richard K. Herrmann and Mary M. Matterer of Morris James LLP ([/firms/morris-james](#)), and George A. Riley and Luann L. Simmons of O'Melveny & Myers LLP ([/firms/o-melveny-myers](#)).

MobileMedia is represented by Steven M. Bauer, Justin J. Daniels, Safraz W. Ishmael, Kenneth Rubenstein, Anthony C. Coles and Alan Federbush of Proskauer Rose LLP ([/firms/proskauer-rose](#)), and Jack B. Blumenfeld, Rodger D. Smith II and Jeremy A. Tigan of Morris Nichols Arshat & Tunnell LLP ([/firms/morris-nichols](#)).

The case is MobileMedia Ideas LLC v. Apple Inc., case number 1:10-cv-00258 ([/cases/4d4aca982f02213137000001](#)), in the U.S. District Court for the District of Delaware.

--Editing by John Quinn.

[\(/articles/370586/apple-still-on-hook-in-mobilemedia-smartphone-ip-suit?related\\_articles=1\)](#)

[Apple, HTC, RIM Face Patent Suits Over Smartphones \(/articles/159292/apple-htc-rim-face-patent-suits-over-smartphones?related\\_articles=1\)](#)

[Apple Wins ITC Patent Ruling Against Nokia \(/articles/234839/apple-wins-itc-patent-ruling-against-nokia?related\\_articles=1\)](#)

[Nokia Sues Apple Over 7 More Tech Patents \(/articles/235289/nokia-sues-apple-over-7-more-tech-patents?related\\_articles=1\)](#)

[ITC To Review Nokia-Apple Patent Case \(/articles/247918/itc-to-review-nokia-apple-patent-case?related\\_articles=1\)](#)

[Microsoft Won't Budge On Do-Not-Track Plans Despite Backlash \(/technology/articles/401439/microsoft-won-t-budge-on-do-not-track-plans-despite-backlash?article\\_more\\_news=1\)](#)

Microsoft Corp.'s general counsel said Wednesday that the company won't reverse its controversial decision to enable its latest browser to automatically send a signal to websites that blocks online tracking, despite widespread industry criticism that threatens to derail efforts to craft a global self-regulatory standard.